

Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing



from the June 2005

English Language Arts 30–1

Diploma Examination

•

*Personal Response to Texts Assignment and
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment*

This document was written primarily for:

Students	✓
Teachers	✓
Administrators	✓
Parents	✓
General Public	✓
Others	

Copyright 2005, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Learner Assessment Branch, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

Special permission is granted to **Alberta educators only** to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do **not** contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document **shall not** be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).

Contents

Acknowledgements	ii
Introduction	1
English Language Arts 30–1 June 2005 Writing Assignments	3
Personal Response to Texts Assignment	4
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	8
English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation	10
Impressions from Standards Confirmation June 2005	11
Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries	14
English Language Arts 30–1 Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005	14
English Language Arts 30–1 Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005	48
Scoring Categories and Criteria	78

Acknowledgements

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The cooperation of these students has allowed us to continue defining the standards of writing performance expected in connection with diploma examinations and demonstrating approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following standards confirmers: Laurie Chomany, Lisa Daverne, John Finnie, Nancy Fontaine, Jim Forrest, Martha Howson, Debra Leslie, Brent McKeown, and Brenda Prentice.

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Publishing Unit of the Learner Assessment Branch, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by e-mail to Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca, Harvey.Stables@gov.ab.ca, or Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca,

or by regular mail at

Alberta Education
Box 43
44 Capital Boulevard
10044 108 Street NW
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.

Introduction

The written responses in this document are examples of English Language Arts 30–1 diploma examination writing that received scores of *Satisfactory* (S), *Proficient* (Pf), or *Excellent* (E). These sample responses are taken from the June 2005 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help you and your students to understand the standards for English Language Arts 30–1 diploma examination writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the June 2005 marking session and that anchor the selection of similar sample responses for subsequent marking sessions in 2005. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student’s work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

Selection and Use of Sample Papers

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the June 2005 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students’ writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the June 2005 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination.

Cautions

1. The commentaries are brief.

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.

Students must be free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will best enable them to present their ideas. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.

The students' writing in this document illustrates *just a few of the many* successful organizational and rhetorical strategies used in June 2005.

We strongly recommend that you caution your students that there is *no preferred approach* to an assignment except the approach that best accomplishes the student writer's goal of effectively communicating his or her own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments or to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations.

It is the *approaches* taken by students at the *standard of excellence* that students being examined in the future should consider emulating, not their words or ideas. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, and form and structure as a way of developing an individual voice and engaging the reader in ideas and forms that the student has considered.

Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.

Under examination conditions, students produce *first-draft writing*. Given more time, students would be expected to produce papers of considerably improved quality, particularly in the dimensions of **Presentation** and of **Matters of Correctness**.

English Language Arts 30–1 June 2005 Writing Assignments

June 2005

English Language Arts 30–1

Part A: Written Response

Grade 12 Diploma Examination

Description

Time: 2½ hours. This examination was developed to be completed in 2½ hours; however, you may take an additional ½ hour to complete the examination.

Plan your time carefully.

Part A: Written Response contributes 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination mark and consists of two assignments.

- **Personal Response to Texts Assignment**
Value 20% of total examination mark
- **Critical /Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**
Value 30% of total examination mark

Recommendation: Read and reflect upon the whole examination before you begin to write. Time spent in planning may result in better writing.

Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet. Feel free to make corrections and revisions directly on your written work.

Instructions

- Complete the Personal Response to Texts Assignment first. The Personal Response to Texts Assignment is designed to allow you time to think and reflect upon the ideas that you may also explore in the Critical /Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment.
- Complete **both** assignments.
- You may use the following print references:
 - an English and/or bilingual dictionary
 - a thesaurus
 - an authorized writing handbook
- Space is provided in this booklet for planning and for your written work.
- Use blue or black ink for your written work.

Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors

- Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point or larger font such as Times.
- Double-space your final copy.
- Staple your final printed work to the pages indicated for word-processed work for each assignment. Hand in all work.
- Indicate in the space provided on the back cover that you have attached word-processed pages.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes

Carefully read and consider the texts on pages 4 to 6, and then complete the assignment that follows.

The excerpt from the novel *Snow Falling on Cedars* is unavailable for electronic posting. The bibliographic information for this excerpt is: Guterson, David. *Snow Falling on Cedars*. New York: Vintage Contemporaries, 1995, pp. 438–439.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

The poem "Casting and Gathering" is unavailable for electronic posting. The bibliographic information for this poem is: Heaney, Seamus. "Casting and Gathering." In *Seeing Things*. London: Faber and Faber Limited, 1991, p. 13.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

This photograph was one of many that Carl Cook included in his print exhibit which was last shown at Seattle's Pacific Science Center in 1988. The photographs for the show were taken at Wolf Haven, a wilderness sanctuary for captive-born wolves.

Wolf Greeting—Rogue & Pretty Girl—1986



When you greet your dog with a playful squeeze on the nose, he usually responds with an outpouring of affection—and maybe a little slobber on your hand. This moment of bonding is important. By displaying dominance (wrapping your hand around his muzzle) and mixing it with affection, you have reassured him of his place within his pack—your family, and this reassurance is vital to your dog's well being. Dominant/submissive behavior is the glue that holds the wolf—and dog pack—together. Deep down inside every dog, from teacup poodle to Great Dane beats the heart of their common ancestor, the wolf.

The greeting you and your dog exchange has the same meaning as the behavior exhibited here with Rogue greeting his mate, Pretty Girl.

Photograph and text by Carl Cook. © Copyright 1986, 1996, Carl Cook. All Rights Reserved.

PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT**Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes****The Assignment**

In the excerpt from *Snow Falling on Cedars*, the writer describes the dual consequences of the islanders' prolonged mutual dependence. In the poem "Casting and Gathering," the speaker observes the tension that exists between opposing perspectives. "Wolf Greeting—Rogue & Pretty Girl—1986," a photograph of two timber wolves, reflects the interplay between dominant and submissive impulses.

What do these texts suggest to you about the ways in which the desire for independence and the need for security shape an individual's identity? Support your idea(s) with reference to one or more of the texts presented and to your previous knowledge and/or experience.

In your writing, you must

- select a *prose form* that is appropriate to the ideas you wish to express and that will enable you to effectively communicate to the reader
- discuss ideas and/or impressions that are relevant to this assignment

Personal Response to Texts Assignment*Initial Planning*

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

Additional space is provided for planning in the examination booklet.

CRITICAL / ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS ASSIGNMENT**Suggested time: approximately 1½ to 2 hours**

Reflect on the ideas and impressions that you discussed in the Personal Response to Texts Assignment concerning the ways in which the desire for independence and the need for security shape an individual's identity.

The Assignment

Consider how the desire for independence and the need for security have been reflected and developed in a literary text or texts you have studied. Discuss the idea(s) developed by the text creator(s) about an individual's attempt to reconcile the desire to act independently with the need for security.

In your planning and writing, consider the following instructions.

- You must focus your discussion on a literary text or texts *other than* the texts provided in this examination booklet.
- When considering the work(s) that you know well, select a literary text or texts meaningful to you and relevant to this assignment. Choose from short stories, novels, plays, screenplays, poetry, films, or other literary texts that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–1.
- Carefully consider your *controlling idea* or how you will create a strong *unifying effect* in your response.
- As you develop your ideas, support them with appropriate, relevant, and meaningful examples from literary text(s).

CRITICAL / ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text(s) you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text(s) you have chosen.

Literary Text(s) and
Text Creator(s)

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)

Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text(s) you have identified above as support for your response. You may respond in point form, using a diagram such as a mind map, or in another format of your choice. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)* in the examination booklet.

English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation

Background

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Learner Assessment Branch staff use a process called *Standards Confirmation* to establish and illustrate expectations for students' work in relation to the scoring criteria and to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for students' achievement start with the demands of the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* and with the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is comprised of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Learner Assessment Branch staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results-reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria and the examples of students' work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the *2004–2005 English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin*. Following each of the January and June marking sessions, sample papers are selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee. These responses are used to train markers and are posted on the Alberta Education web site at www.education.gov.ab.ca in documents entitled *Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing from the January 2005 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination* and *Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing from the June 2005 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination*.

The standards confirmation process:

- confirms the appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students' work
- selects student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria to be used when training markers
- results in written rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students' work

Impressions from Standards Confirmation June 2005

The intended audience of the Impressions from Standards Confirmation was teachers who served as markers during the June 2005 marking session. This information has been included in this document to provide context regarding issues addressed by markers when assessing student responses to the examination assignments.

Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Markers need to carefully review the scoring criteria for both **Ideas and Impressions** and **Presentation**. It is very important to note the following:

- Markers should review the texts provided in the assignment and reread the prompt and assignment at the start of each marking day. This is important when students have made implicit connections to the text(s); moreover, being aware of the texts and the wording of the prompt ensures that markers can readily distinguish between the material provided and the student's own ideas as well as determine how the texts have informed the response. Markers should expect that the students' ideas and impressions are informed by the details within the text(s) and the contextual information presented in the preamble. Standards confirmers found that many students included a greater degree of specificity when using details from the text(s) or, alternatively, when "fleshing out" the text(s) with their own imaginative details.
- A strong **Presentation** could unduly influence the score in **Ideas and Impressions** because these domains are naturally integrated. When marking a response, markers should consciously return to the focus section of the scoring criteria to reorient themselves to the distinction between the two scoring categories.
- Standards confirmers observed that many students have developed more confidence in dealing with the strengths and constraints of different prose forms. Markers must take care to read the students' comments in the **Initial Planning** section wherein students might indicate their reasoning and intention in choosing a particular prose form. When considering the student's creation of **voice**, the focus is on "the context created by the student in the chosen prose form." Markers must also carefully consider the effectiveness of "the student's development of a **unifying effect**." These distinctions are especially significant when assessing creative responses.

Most students clearly addressed the topic, presenting their ideas and impressions in a variety of ways. The majority of students demonstrated the ability to incorporate, implicitly or explicitly, one or more texts into their responses. Standards confirmers suggest that markers will occasionally need to read students' work more than once to appreciate what a student has attempted and, in fact, accomplished.

- As in the past, many students have made synonymous reference to the topic by defining independence as “autonomy,” or “self-reliance,” and described their personal definition of the state of being independent explicitly or implicitly. Similarly, students appropriately made reference to security as a “comfort zone,” synonymously as “belonging,” or as a specific kind of security such as financial security. Some students have chosen to deal explicitly with the relationship between independence and security while implicitly dealing with the influence of these attributes on identity.
- As in the past, some students did not explicitly support their ideas “with reference to one or more of the texts presented.” In some responses, however, an obvious parallel to the text(s) was apparent, whereas in others an implicit understanding of the text(s) was evident in the presentation of ideas. It is important to note that an explicit reference to the text(s) or the topic is not needed to fulfill the requirements of the assignment. The students’ exploration of ideas and impressions, however, must address the question in the assignment, and markers must be able to identify the students’ inferences and the implicit relationship among the topic, the texts, and the students’ ideas and support. Standards confirmers observed that, with varying degrees of success, students have consciously found ways of making the relationship among topic, reference, and ideas clear regardless of the chosen prose form.
- Minor misrepresentations of the text, such as when a student confuses Ishmael with his father, are understandable in the context of a timed writing assignment but should not unduly affect the quality of the support the students use to develop their ideas. It is also appropriate for a student to speculate about wolf behaviour beyond information that has been provided in the text.

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

In the Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, students employed a number of approaches to fulfill the assignment. The topic demands that students choose their literature judiciously to address the idea(s) that the text creator(s) develop(s) regarding “an individual’s attempt to reconcile the desire to act independently with the need for security.” Students chose from a wide variety of literary texts, including film, to support their ideas. When students elected to use more than one text, standards confirmers noted that students did so with varying degrees of specificity. In these, as in all cases, markers must consider the students’ treatment of the texts, the selection and quality of their evidence, and how well that evidence is integrated and developed to support the students’ ideas.

Standards confirmers observed that most students have considered the implications of the full assignment and have demonstrated an understanding of the relationship between independence and security. Many students have used text(s) that illustrate(s) the desire for independence and the need for security that motivates an individual to take action, to make decisions, and to determine how they view their lives. Alternately, many students have dealt with text(s) that illustrate(s) that individuals respond to change, challenges, or conflict in ways that reveal how secure or independent they are and how successful they have been in reconciling the desire for independence and the need for security.

Some students have appropriately used a creative approach to organize and express their ideas in a critical and/or analytical manner.

Reminders for Markers

- Check for the literary text(s) selection in the Critical /Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment **before** beginning to mark the paper, especially with the increasing number of new texts appearing in student responses in the examination. Students assume that markers have recently taught the literary text(s) rather than just seen or read the work.
- Rereading the texts presented in the Personal Response to Texts Assignment, the prompts, and the assignments at the start of each marking day will keep markers alert to the ways in which students have incorporated what has been given in the assignments into their responses.
- Markers must consider the students' comments presented in the ***Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*** when assessing the scoring category of **Supporting Evidence**. Some students reveal thoughtful awareness of their purpose in choosing a particular text, although many students use this section as an opportunity to plan their work or to form an outline.

Examples of Students' Writing with Teachers' Commentaries

English Language Arts 30–1

Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

Mini essay format. A way
to display my thoughts
more clearly to the reader.

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

~~The situation~~

Each person develops their identity by moving through life's obstacles. The majority of the development of their identity occurs at a younger age. A very important factor to a person through out life is being surrounded by friends. How a person feels within their interactions with their friends directly influences ~~their~~ how they shape their identity. "Snow falling on cedars", by David Guterson shows the reader many factors of security within a group that can affect how a person develops. If you relate the small island group to an average example of friendship you can see that the factors are the same.

In the excerpt one can see that a basic security of health and home can be achieved. The small population

(Page 2 of 4)

Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

makes it possible for all of the families to know one another. This provides a safe feeling of living. In a friendship one can obtain the same security of living in that you can feel safe in that relationship. With this basic security that is provided, a person can begin to shape their confidence and ability to show and receive respect.

The narrator in "Snow falling on cedars", describes how a lack of security can negatively aid in the development of people. The small area of the island gives the population a feeling of being "cornered". The people there developed the tendencies to "not speak freely", and gained a "fear of opening up". The same can occur to a person now, when they ~~don't~~ do not feel as though they can safely speak and act when in a relationship. If a friendship does not provide that

Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

type of security, a person can become ~~a shy person~~ ^{shy and} withdrawn. Also they can ~~not~~ possibly have difficulties making new friends in the future.

Whether a person is positively or negatively impacted, ~~by~~ the presence of security is a main factor that influences this. Security in a friendship can allow a person to develop confidence, and good people skills allowing that person to become independent. Lack of security can cause a person to become withdrawn, or afraid to open up, ~~and~~ If a person cannot obtain any security they could ~~become anti-social and destroy~~ damage their future because they have not developed proper interaction skills. A person's ~~feel~~ perception of security directly influence how they develop and impacts who they are in the future.

(Page 4 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (S) • The student’s exploration of the topic is generalized. • Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. • Support is adequate and clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.	The student’s discussion of the excerpt from <i>Snow Falling on Cedars</i> and the idea that “Security in a friendship can allow a person to develop confidence, and good people skills allowing that person to become independent” indicate a generalized exploration of the topic. The idea that “If you relate the small island group to an average example of friendship you can see that the factors are the same” is relevant. Perceptions such as “The small population makes it possible for all of the families to know one another. This provides a safe feeling of living. In a friendship one can obtain the same security of living in that you can feel safe in that relationship” are straightforward. Adequate support (“The small area of the island gives the population a feeling of being ‘cornered’. The people there developed the tendencies to ‘not speak freely’, and gained a ‘fear of opening up’”) clarifies impressions such as “The same can occur to a person now, when they do not feel as though they can safely speak and act when in a relationship.”	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (S) • The voice created by the student is apparent. • Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional. • The unifying effect is appropriately developed.	The student’s voice is apparent in statements such as “A very important factor to a person through out life is being surrounded by friends” and “If a friendship does not provide that type of security, a person can become shy and withdrawn.” Adequate stylistic choices are evident in “With this basic security that is provided, a person can begin to shape their confidence and ability to show and recieve respect” and “Whether a person is possitively or negatively impacted, the presence of security is a main factor that influences this.” The student’s tone is conventional, as in “In the excerpt one can see that a basic security of health and home can be achieved” and “If a person cannot obtain any security they could damage their future because they have not developed proper interaction skills.” The unifying effect established at the outset— “ ‘Snow falling on cedars’, by David Guterson shows the reader many factors of security within a group that can affect how a person develops”—is appropriately developed with “How a person feels within their interactions with their friends directly influences how they shape their identity” and supports the conclusion that “A person’s perception of security directly influence how they develope and impacts who they are in the future.”	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

I am writing a short story on
how people strive for independence
in order to achieve security.

(Page 1 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Satisfactory (S)

Search for Independence

April 2 1940-

It was the beginning of the Second World War. My schoolmates were talking non stop about how they wish they were able to join in the war effort against the evil doings of the German army. Being two years older than the rest of my class and almost done high school I was of the age where I could join the army. I was eager to be on my own and done with school for it was not my thing and freedom was quite high on the priority list. Seeing my older siblings on their own and beginning families already made me feel left behind. To be independent but to also be a part of something bigger is something quite special. For after all isn't independence just being part of the bigger picture. You go from being a part of your family to being part of your country to being a part of this world. The little bubble that provides you with safety and security keeps growing. My father was ecstatic when he heard I wanted to join the army. He couldn't believe his son would take it upon himself and do something so courageous. The drive for independence increase two fold hearing those words of praise from my father. So I packed my belongings after graduation and enlisted in the army. The sense of being on my own was quite exciting.

(Page 2 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Satisfactory (S)

October 2 1941

It has been a year and a half since I have joined the army and I now realize that my search for independence actually led to security. The army was a way that I could be involved in something where I didn't have to be totally independent. I am given food everyday and a place to sleep. I am on my own in the fact that my parents don't tell what to do all the time but I am told where to fight and who to fight. The irony behind me joining the army to become independent is the fact that the army is there to provide security for me. I have come to realize that independence basically means I can make more decisions on my own but still am limited. I have grasped the concept of this word "independence." No matter what you achieve in this world someone will always be giving you some sort of security whether it be your boss or your country's leader. Security is an emotion that is needed in order to survive. By achieving any kind of independence you will also feel safe and secure in this world.

(Page 3 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (S) - The student’s exploration of the topic is generalized. - Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. - Support is adequate and clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.	The student’s creation of the persona of a young soldier in World War II sets the context for a generalized exploration of the idea that “The irony behind me joining the army to become independent is the fact that the army is there to provide security for me.” The relationship between the young man who joins the army and his father—“He couldn’t believe his son would take it upon himself and do something so courageous”—and the relationship between Ishmael and Arthur in the excerpt from <i>Snow Falling on Cedars</i> is implicitly connected. Perceptions are relevant, as in “The army was a way that I could be involved in something where I didn’t have to be totally independent,” and straightforward, as in “I have come to realize that independence basically means I can make more decisions on my own but still am limited.” Adequate support such as “I am given food everyday and a place to sleep. I am on my own in the fact that my parents don’t tell what to do all the time but I am told where to fight and who to fight” clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (S) • The voice created by the student is apparent. • Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional. • The unifying effect is appropriately developed.	As illustrated in “Being two years older than the rest of my class and almost done high school I was of the age where I could join the army,” the voice of the soldier as created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices such as “I was eager to be on my own and done with school for it was not my thing and freedom was quite high on the priority list” and “For after all isn’t independence just being part of the bigger picture” are adequate. The student’s creation of tone is conventional, as in “You go from being a part of your family to being part of your country to being a part of this world.” The unifying effect is appropriately developed in two journal entries that reinforce the soldier’s awareness that “It has been a year and a half since I have joined the army and I now realize that my search for independence actually led to security.”	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

My prose form will be written
as a journal entry, therefore, a
more personal approach. I'll relate
2 texts to my personal experiences.

(Page 1 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

June 14, 2005

Journal Entry: One's Path

Life is strange. Innocence is the basis of your life when you are a child, and when you are forced to grow up, everything around you changes. It alters so suddenly in fact, that you're awareness of it flees your train of thought. This analysis of life never occurred to me until I faced certain events. My graduation ceremony was a huge wake up call for example. The fact that I'll be leaving to go to a dance school in Quebec in less than a month also suggests the severity and closeness of my future. I'm not saying I don't want to grow up because that would be completely false. There's nothing more exciting to me than experiencing new surroundings, meeting new and interesting people, living independently, but nothing frightens me as much either. No ghost or supernatural creature could possibly compare to the fear that overcomes my body when I think that my destiny obliges me to leave my island... my pack.

Much like the father in David Guterson's extract from "Snow Falling on Cedars", I've belonged to a place that will forever be my home. My mind nor my heart knows no other. However, the path I have chosen for myself will bring me far away from all that I know and I cherish the most, and that will be the most challenging episode in my adolescence. Of course, it's not the end of the world, in fact, it's the beginning of a new chapter in my life that will mark my identity. But I just find that as I turn the pages, I drift away further into obscurity, and the more I approach my dreams and goals, the more lost I seem to feel.

(Page 2 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

We develop a lot of friendships during a lifetime, but the most memorable ones are those who aren't in your reach. They're the ones that you miss the most. Leaving loved ones behind, in death or in travel, is never an easy task. Whenever I did leave for summer vacations or volleyball tournaments, the bonus point was that I knew I was coming back to these people. But this time around, whoever I leave behind, I won't see until Christmas. My family and friends are the most important thing in my life. They're my supply of security, support and comfort, and nothing will be more painful than waving them off at the airport. Like the response to Carl Cook's photograph suggesting that the friendship and feeling of affiliation of dogs and wolves is vital reassurance for their well-being, my trust and will to belong, will always reside amongst my close ones.

Independence is something that I managed to dream of ever since I was a young girl: playing with plastic kitchen appliances, doing my own banking with Monopoly money and dressing up my dolls in diapers and dresses. But my view concerning independence has drastically changed from being a simple childhood game to a real life experience. It would never cross my mind that one day, I would be on the path to eventually embracing these acts. I've come to learn that growing up makes you appreciate the small things a great deal more: it's just a shame I didn't realize this before. Voices that directed me throughout my life, that guided me to make the right choices, will always leave an imprint in my mind. I even agree with certain words my parents spoke such as "Your younger days are your best, so take advantage of it." But how many of us honestly believed that? Then, I guess it's true dad...

"As you grow older, your parents grow wiser".

(Page 3 of 3)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (Pf) - The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. - Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. - Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.	The student purposefully uses her graduation ceremony as a starting point to explore the tension she feels between the desire for independence and the need for security. Going to a dance school in Quebec excites her, but she fears leaving “my island... my pack.” In exploring this tension, the student also comes to see that her “view concerning independence has drastically changed from being a simple childhood game to a real life experience.” Although the student has experienced separation from family and friends during previous summers and practised independence in her childhood games, the prospect of a lengthy separation leads her to the thoughtful perception that her “family and friends are the most important thing in my life” and that “nothing will be more painful then waving them off at the airport.” As well, she offers a considered appreciation of the role her family has played in the idea that “Voices that directed me throughout my life, that guided me to make the right choices, will always leave an imprint in my mind.” The student specifically supports and strengthens the idea that she has practised independence in her younger days when she recalls “summer vacations or volleyball tournaments” and “playing with plastic kitchen appliances, doing my own banking with Monopoly money and dressing up my dolls in diapers and dresses.”	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (Pf) - The voice created by the student is distinct. - Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. - The unifying effect is capably developed.	The student creates a distinct voice in arriving at the mature recognition that the frightening challenge of leaving her cherished home can be a positive stage of growth, as in “Of course, it’s not the end of the world, in fact, it’s the beginning of a new chapter in my life that will mark my identity.” Stylistic choices such as “<i>Life</i> is strange” and “the more I approach my dreams and goals, the more lost I seem to feel” are specific. The student’s creation of tone is competent, as is evident in “I’ve come to learn that growing up makes you appreciate the small things a great deal more: it’s just a shame I didn’t realize this before.” The student capably develops a unifying effect by seeing how her imminent move to Quebec has forced her to re-examine and reappraise her life with her family. In the introduction, the student draws her reader’s attention to the fact that “Innocence is the basis of your life when you are a child, and when you are forced to grow up, everything around you changes.” In the body of the response, the student looks at, with new eyes, the impact of her family and friends. In the conclusion, she reflects somewhat wryly that “I even agree with certain words my parents spoke,” thus reaffirming how her understanding of the tension between the desire for independence and the need for security has shaped her identity.	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

individual Identity
form: Journal entry observing wolf
pack behavior and thoughts concerning
the visual displays of dominance
in the wolf pack group.

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

Journal of Carl Cook

I had been in the wilderness sanctuary for quite some time now. It was early morning. My body still paralyzed from the bitter cold that is surrounding me. Several months ago, I had decided to make a substantial choice in my life. I can still hear my wife saying, “Are you sure you want to do this?” I thought nothing of this at the time. Why did she need to see me? This choice provoking this question was to study the pattern of the wolf and is what leads me here today. I never had any real plan as to what to observe, little did I know it would change my life forever. I hear a wolf calling to me in the distance. This is my signal to pack up my things and pursue this intimate animal.

I inch my way along the narrow trail jostled between trees and bushes. It was as if the forest was about to close in on me but I gathered my strength and pulled through. I had been on the trail of a pack of wolves for what seemed like eternity and never quite came to appreciate them, at least not yet. My feet had already become tired but I knew I needed to push on. I stare at the ground for any sign of tracks. I see some and they tempt me to go further. I walk through the rough terrain, desperately seeking to catch glimpse of a single wolf. Just as I was collecting my thoughts, my eye caught a movement of something on the horizon. My eyes pierced into the early morning sun. It was a wolf! It was as though a new source of energy consumed my soul. With endless bounds, I ran in leaps towards them for a chance to study them in their environment.

I was breathing heavily as I approached them but the opportunity to see them outweighed any trauma. I shadowed myself behind a rock to see a group of five wolves feasting on a recently made kill. Their behavior compelled me. Such savage like behavior but was normal to them. Just then, a fox approached. Very wearily, it sought to

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

claim its own part of the kill. To my surprise, one wolf raised its head and shot dagger's through its eyes at the fox. It knew it was not welcome here. This appeared to be the dominant wolf for it was the biggest. Taking time from its meal, it chased the fox away with a ferocious growl. Was the wolf trying to protect his pack? Was he merely trying to fight for what he saw was his? His independence fascinated me but I saw a hidden objective in his brief torment. He was ensuring the security of his pack, which appeared to me, had not eaten for quite some time. This made me think about my family at home. I remember my dear wife's words. What security have I provided them by leaving them for such a long period? Was I really taking to heart what was best for them? I was the soil to their flower and now realized I had neglected to nurture their growth. I now had a new understanding. I picked my head up from my journal for a second to see the dominant male give a playful squeeze to one of the younger males. I grabbed my camera and took a photo. I knew this image would be cemented in my mind for the rest of my life. Not only can the wolf feel his independence, through the chasing of the fox, his gentle nibble was ensuring the survival of his pack and guaranteeing their security. I quickly returned my camera to my knapsack and sensed it was time for me to be heading home to my family.

I returned home to my wife a few days later. "I'm so happy your home," she said as I walked through the door. Who knew such simple words could have such a lasting effect. I kissed her, hugged her, and promised I would never leave her again. My ordeal with the wolves had given me a new outlook on life. The provider was now MY identity and dedicated my life to fulfilling her wishes. My time with the wolves was very short lived, but the effect they had on my life will last a lifetime. It made me realize what was

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

important, and that was my family. They had touched me on so many levels and made me the man I am today.

(Page 4 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (Pf) • The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. • Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.	Assuming the persona of Carl Cook, the student purposefully explores how Cook’s observation of wolves changes his perception of his identity. Cook’s character is initially self-absorbed and singleminded in his passion for wolves, but a significant incident provokes a deeper appreciation for his family. The student thoughtfully notes how one moment can “change my life forever.” The characterization of Carl Cook’s pursuit of an independent life by studying wolves only to discover his need to offer his family security and protection—“Not only can the wolf feel his independence, through the chasing of the fox, his gentle nibble was ensuring the survival of his pack and guaranteeing their security. I quickly returned my camera to my knapsack and sensed it was time for me to be heading home to my family”—is considered. Specific support for the characterization of Cook as naive and dismissive of his wife’s concerns is evident in “Why did she need to see me?” Cook’s passionate interest in the wolves (as in “I walk through the rough terrain, desperately seeking to catch glimpse of a single wolf”) and his sudden recognition of the parallel between the wolf pack and his own family (as in “This made me think about my family at home. I remember my dear wife’s words. What security have I provided them by leaving them for such a long period?”) strengthen the student’s ideas and impressions.	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (Pf) • The voice created by the student is distinct. • Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent. • The unifying effect is capably developed.	The student creates a distinct voice for the character of Carl Cook in statements such as “I inch my way along the narrow trail jostled between trees and bushes. It was as if the forest was about to close in on me but I gathered my strength and pulled through.” Stylistic choices (as illustrated in “Taking time from its meal, it chased the fox away with a ferocious growl. Was the wolf trying to protect his pack? Was he merely trying to fight for what he saw was his?”) are specific. The student’s competent creation of Cook’s interrogative tone allows the student to lead Cook to question his own life, as evident in “Was I really taking to heart what was best for them?” The student capably develops a unifying effect by beginning with Cook’s dismissal of his wife’s questioning of his mission to study wolves and by ending with Cook’s appreciation of his wife’s welcoming words in “Who knew such simple words could have such a lasting effect.”	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

Personal essay. compare the need
for security in defining the identity
of an individual.

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

In life, it is often easier to conform to the expectations of society, than to make our own individual decisions. As a result, an individual's identity is shaped by a need for security, which causes people to adhere to the societal expectations. In An excerpt from Snow Falling on Cedars, by David Guterson, and the picture, wolf greeting, reveal the safety found in conforming. However, there is also an underlying sense of restraint when an individual's identity depends solely on their community. In exchange for security, individual freedom is compromised.

In a community environment, an individual's role identity is shaped by the role they play. As long as they accomplish that role, they are guaranteed social security and acceptance. In Snow Falling on Cedars, Ishmael's father conforms to the island society's expectations. He is able to pursue his own interests and hobbies, such as writing, as long as he fulfills "certain duties and conditions." His social acceptance is assured as long as he carefully

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

avoids offending other citizens. As a result, Arthur "carefully pruned" his articles to prevent being alienated from society. He tells his son that "an enemy on an island is an enemy forever," revealing the risk of stepping outside society's expectations.

¶ There is a ^{certain} safety found in not challenging society and abiding by its rules. This safety is also found in wolf packs, as shown by the display of dominance in the picture, Wolf Greeting - Rogue and Pretty Girl. Wolf packs function on a dominance hierarchy where the wolves at the top control the wolves at the bottom. Dominance: One way of showing dominance is through wrapping one's muzzle over the muzzle of a lower ranking wolf. In the picture, Pretty Girl shows no resistance and ~~accepts~~ submits to Rogue. By maintaining a social hierarchy, ^{in which her identity is defined;} Pretty Girl is ensured a position in the wolf pack ^{along with} ~~and is ensured~~ the food and resources required to survive.

Despite the benefits of ^{following} ~~conforming~~ to societal expectations, an individual's freedom is sacrificed. ^{one's} Their identity is restricted by society, which demands conformity. Arthur is forced to "tr[e]d'casily upon the emotions of another" to

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30-1

Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

~~of prevent~~ ^{conflict} ~~offense~~. Emotions, such as "regret and silent brooding," must be withheld from others, ^{of offense} out of fear. Freedom of speech was also restricted to ensure social security. The description of the citizens being "corned" by the sea emphasizes the lack of freedom that comes with social security. Despite Arthur's realization of his limitations, shown with his ^{love-hate relationship with society} ~~Arthur still chooses to conform~~, Similarly, in wolf packs, individual wolves must conform to the wishes of the Alpha male. The Alpha male determines who mates, when to hunt, who is dominant over another. Despite social security found in conformity, an individual's freedom is compromised. However, ~~as~~ as shown by Arthur and Pretty Girl, it is often preferable to have ^{one's} ~~their~~ identity determined by society than to risk alienation. Through the texts, it can be shown that individuals tend to allow society to shape their identities. Both Arthur and Pretty Girl decided to conform to their community in order to gain social security. However, with security comes restriction of individual freedom. Through Arthur, it is shown that conformity cannot allow personal freedom, fulfillment. His emotions, actions, and beliefs are confined by the values of his society.

(Page 4 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (E) • The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. • Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.	The introductory paragraph prepares the reader for the insightful exploration of the idea that “there is also an underlying sense of restraint when an individual’s identity depends solely on their community. In exchange for security, individual freedom is compromised.” The ideas that “There is a certain safety found in not challenging society and abiding by its rules,” that “By maintaining a social hierarchy, in which her identity is defined; Pretty Girl is ensured a position in the wolf pack along with the food and resources required to survive,” and that “Despite the benefits of following societal expectations, an individual’s freedom is sacrificed” are confident and discerning. Support such as “Arthur is forced to ‘tr[e]d easily upon the emotions of another’ to prevent conflict” is precise and apt. The student connects this idea to “In the picture, Pretty Girl shows no resistance and submits to Rogue,” thus reinforcing that “Despite social security found in conformity, an individual’s freedom is compromised.” The example “As a result, Arthur ‘carefully pruned’ his articles to prevent being alienated from society” reinforces the student’s idea that “In a community environment, an individual’s identity is shaped by the role they play. As long as they accomplish that role, they are guaranteed social security and acceptance.”	E

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 1 Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (E) • The voice created by the student is convincing. • Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. • The unifying effect is skillfully developed.	The analytical voice in relation to the critical prose form (evident in “Emotions, such as ‘regret and silent brooding,’ must be withheld from others out of fear of offense” and “Through Arthur, it is shown that conformity cannot allow personal fulfillment. His emotions, actions, and beliefs are confined by the values of his society”) is convincing. Stylistic choices, as demonstrated in “He tells his son that ‘an enemy on an island is an enemy forever,’ revealing the risk of stepping outside society’s expectations,” are precise. The student’s creation of tone in statements such as “As a result, an individual’s identity is shaped by a need for security, which causes people to adhere to societal expectations” is adept. The unifying effect is skillfully developed as the student sets the context, develops examples, and confidently synthesizes ideas and support as illustrated in “However, as shown by Arthur and Pretty Girl, it is often preferable to have one’s identity determined by society than to risk alienation.”	E

English Language Arts 30-1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

You may respond from a personal, critical, and/or creative perspective. Keep in mind that regardless of the form you choose, you must communicate clearly to the reader.

Briefly identify your choice of prose form, your reason(s) for choosing this prose form, and what you intend to communicate.

I am writing a memoir from the perspective
of an adult who left her life behind. By
writing a memoir, I can tie quotations from
the poem "Casting and Gathering".

By incorporating quotations I am trying to show that there is unity and similarity between opposition - therefore, the opposition shown in the poem can be used to help communicate the ideas in my own memoir.

"Casting and Gathering" is about opposing
perspectives, and my piece is about
opposing times in someone's life - one
where she is dependant, and the other
independant. I wish to communicate
that, to become independant, change
is necessary.

The girl's new life is her independence, her old life gave her security. Though she loves the friend she left behind, she communicates that she needed to leave her, and leave the security that her past gave her in order to obtain independence.

Potions - metaphor for her old life, the past she left behind. When she sees her daughter making potions, it shows that her past does not leave her, but that she isn't living it anymore because she chose independence.

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

When we were about ten, we thought the woman who worked in the flea market making trinkets out of jade was a witch – a good witch, inspired more by Glenda than the Wicked Witch of the West. This developed into the firm belief that we were witches. We would crowd around my bathroom counter making potions - not love potions; we had no need for love. These were potions that would convince our parents to let you stay the night, and assure that we would stay best friends forever. Of course, we never had the audacity to pour them into the dinnertime wine, considering they were made from an expert balance of Barbie shampoo and my mother's "too expensive for playtime" perfume. And we didn't stay best friends forever. "I trust contrariness", and contrary to the fact that we thought we would be together forever, bubbling concoctions couldn't save our friendship from the inevitable: the need to be independent from one another. You gave me security: I could always predict the outcome of our potions; I knew exactly what the creations of ten-year-old chemists could do. But I learned that I did not need the security you gave me, I needed independence, and I found it in create a life separate from you and separate from the stability our friendship gave me.

The sad reality is that we needed to develop that independence apart from magic, and apart from each other. You couldn't come with me to Italy that summer, because you had spent your savings on a new laptop and a two hundred dollar swimsuit that you were in dire need of because on the back of it, there were Japanese characters that read "don't sit on broken glass". I went on my own, and Italy became my refuge. In leaving, part of me knew I was leaving something behind. I was leaving behind the security that my life with you gave me, and embracing the unknown independence Italy offered. I knew the

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

language, and drank in the culture like it was water after a drought. Maybe I was experiencing a drought within myself. I didn't just need to drink in Italy, but I also needed to drink in independence. Italy was my own, something that we didn't share. In Italy, I was "entirely free, no matter whether" I had another life in my past. And I met Marcello in Italy. I know you think that Marcello is the perfect name for the character in a Harlequin novel: when I told you about him, you said "Marcello? I think I saw that name in a book in the one-dollar bin at London Drugs. Marcello –" you joked, trying to mask your laughter with an overdone tone of seriousness –" Marcello stole Carlo's sister away from his family in a fit of lust, and they ran off like Romeo and Juliet –" you couldn't contain your dramatic flare, so you finished by belting into the receiver –" like star crossed lovers! In fair Verona where we-". I interrupted. "Lolita, I love him".

You couldn't believe what you had heard. Your voice, which was reciting Shakespeare minutes ago, stayed silent. You asked me what I was going to do – I had my classes for University booked in the fall, I couldn't just stay in Italy forever. But I did. My heart told me "'Go with it! Give and swerve" into a life of independence, a life of change, a life without you. Marcello, now my husband, at that time was the only thing that didn't offer me security, instead, he offered me the independence I so desperately needed, and I did not choose to come back. I love you, my best friend, and I love my past, but I knew then when I made the decision to stay in Italy that my past could not be part of my future. My past gave me stability. What I needed was freedom, and I could only fulfill this need by making a choice not to return to my past.

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

"I have grown older" and I can see how my childhood seeps into my adult life.

Yesterday, I caught my daughter filling up my half empty bottle of Hermes perfume with water from the fountain in the backyard. When I asked her what she was doing, she told me she was making magic, and then proceeded to apologize in her high-pitched little Italian voice. I stopped her, for I remembered making magic. I made magic with you, using my mother's perfume, just as my daughter was doing. "Years and years go past and I do not move", as I remember that time when we were one and I was dependant on you and the magic. I remember what we once shared, though in the time when I am independent without you. Though I needed to stay in Italy I will not forget the "changing sides" of my life, and I will not forget the time we spent as one.

(Page 4 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Ideas and Impressions (E) • The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful. • Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. • Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.	The student’s exploration of the topic in statements such as “My past gave me stability. What I needed was freedom, and I could only fulfill this need by making a choice not to return to my past” is insightful. Perceptions such as “ ‘I trust contrariness’, and contrary to the fact that we thought we would be together forever, bubbling concoctions couldn’t save our friendship from the inevitable: the need to be independent from one another” and “I didn’t just need to drink in Italy, but I also needed to drink in independence” are confident and discerning. “When we were about ten, we thought the woman who worked in the flea market making trinkets out of jade was a witch – a good witch, inspired more by Glenda than the Wicked Witch of the West” is representative of the precise support that permeates this paper. Support such as “I knew the language, and drank in the culture like it was water after a drought” aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.	E

English Language Arts 30–1
Personal Response to Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example 2 Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Presentation (E) • The voice created by the student is convincing. • Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept. • The unifying effect is skillfully developed.	The conversational voice created by the student in the reflective memoir (evident in statements such as “My heart told me ‘Go with it! Give and swerve’ into a life of independence, a life of change, a life without you” and “Though I needed to stay in Italy I will not forget the ‘changing sides’ of my life, and I will not forget the time we spent as one”) is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise, as in “Marcello – ‘you joked, trying to mask your laughter with an overdone tone of seriousness ‘- Marcello stole Carlo’s sister away from his family in a fit of lust, and they ran off like Romeo and Juliet – ‘you couldn’t contain your dramatic flare, so you finished by belting into the receiver ‘- like star crossed lovers! In fair Verona where we-’. I interrupted. ‘Lolita, I love him.’ ” The student’s creation of tone is adept, as demonstrated in “ ‘Years and years go past and I do not move’, as I remember that time when we were one and I was dependant on you and the magic.” The unifying effect is skillfully developed through the motif of creating magic, as in “We would crowd around my bathroom counter making potions - not love potions; we had no need for love” and “ I made magic with you, using my mother’s perfume, just as my daughter was doing.”	E

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text(s) you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text(s) you have chosen.

Literary Text(s) and
Text Creator(s)

The Bean Trees by
Barbara Kingsolver

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)

Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text(s) you have identified above as support for your response. You may respond in point form, using a diagram such as a mind map, or in another format of your choice. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

Taylor Green feels she need to take
action in her life by setting out on a journey
alone. She saved her money, bought
herself a car, all on her own.

(Page 1 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

We all feel the need to have inner security. Authors use this situation commonly in their novels. The novel in which will be used in making reference to this essay will be "The Bean Trees" by Barbara Kingsolver. Her novel explores the life of a teenager setting out on a journey with no destination. Throughout the novel you can see many areas in which the teenager, named Taylor Greer, is put into a situation where she needs to be independent and take action into her own hands.

In the beginning of the novel, Barbara Kingsolver explains how Taylor does not want to end up like the other girls in her rural community in Kentucky. In her mind, if she was to stay in home town of Pittman County, she would end up pregnant and married to a tobacco farmer. She realizes that she needs to take matters into her own hands. She decides to save her money that she made working at the hospital as a helper in the lab, and buy herself a car. She then went out on her journey alone to find where she truly belonged. Taylor Greer showed her need for independence by setting goals for herself, and reaching them on her own so that she could follow her heart. If she was to rely on other people to set her up to go on her journey, the chances of it actually happening are very small. She needed to grasp reality, and allow herself to make her goals come true.

On Taylor's journey she was given a small American Indian child unexpectedly.

(Page 2 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Instead of her stressing out about it, she decided to deal with it in all ways that she could. She did what she felt was right in this situation, she took matters into her own hands, and dealt with the problem. She came to realize that she needed to take care of this child, whom she later nicknamed Turtle. She knew that the child needed help, love, and nurturing, so she gave it to her. She grew very fond of this child, and she took care of her as if it was her own. She realized the problems that she was facing, and she dealt with them. She knew that she couldn't expect other people to fix these problems for her, so she did what she had to, and could do for the child. This shows her independence to solve her own problems. Taylor knew she had to act independently and she felt secure enough to follow through with her journey even though she had a new partner with her.

When Taylor came to Tucson, Arizona, she made friends with Mattie, the owner of Jesus Is Lord Tires. She knew that she needed to get herself a job, so that she could properly take care of Turtle. Mattie offered her a job, which she took. She found a place to live with Lou Ann and her baby Dwayne Ray. She felt used her desire of independence to find security. She went on her journey, dealt with her problems along the way, and ended up in Tucson. She knew in her heart that she had done this all on her own, the choices she made to try and better

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

herself along with Turtle, as well as just doing what her heart desired. Doing this all independently she was able to find herself secure. She lived with Lou Ann, had a job, and was able to take care of Turtle.

When Taylor was faced with the reality that she had no legal attachment to Turtle, and that she would have to give her up unless she could come up with a legal statement from Turtles legal guardians saying that she was now the legal guardian of Turtle. Taylor knew that she wouldn't be able to give up Turtle willingly. She knew that she had to find Turtles true guardians, and get them to sign papers. When she was unsuccessful she didn't give up. She knew in her heart that she had to do something. She felt secure enough with herself, and her surroundings, that she got her friends Estevan and Esperanza to lie to the people that decided whether or not the adoption papers would be signed. It did turn out successful and Taylor Greer ended up being the legal guardian of April Turtle Greer. You can see how Taylor knew she had to do something, and she went for it. She made her decisions independently, and as she went on her journey for follow her goal, she only asked for the help that she truly needed. She was secure enough with herself, and she felt that she could handle the situation, so she did whatever she could to make sure she became Turtles legal guardian.

(Page 4 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

Throughout the story, it was always a need for Taylor to be independent and secure with herself in order to get where she got. She needed to believe truly in herself that she could handle the situations she was put into. She acted independently with the need for security. Turtle was Taylor's security in the end.

(Page 5 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Thought and Understanding (S) • Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. • Literary interpretations are general but plausible.	Ideas such as “Taylor knew she had to act independently and she felt secure enough to follow through with her journey” are relevant. Straightforward ideas, as in “She knew that she couldn’t expect other people to fix these problems for her, so she did what she had to, and could do for the child,” demonstrate a generalized comprehension of <i>The Bean Trees</i> and the topic. Literary interpretations (“Throughout the novel you can see many areas in which the teenager, named Taylor Greer, is put into a situation where she needs to be independent and take action into her own hands” and “She needed to believe truly in herself that she could handle the situations she was put into”) are general but plausible.	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Supporting Evidence (S) • Support is appropriate, general, and adequately reinforces the student’s ideas but occasionally may lack persuasiveness and/or consistency. • A straightforward connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.	Appropriate support, as demonstrated in “She decides to save her money that she made working at the hospital as a helper in the lab, and buy herself a car,” adequately reinforces ideas such as “Taylor Greer showed her need for independence by setting goals for herself, and reaching them on her own so that she could follow her heart.” The details “She knew that she needed to get herself a job, so that she could properly take care of Turtle. Mattie offered her a job, which she took. She found a place to live with Lou Ann and her baby Dwayne Ray” are illustrative of general support. The student maintains a straightforward connection to Taylor’s independent response to challenges in statements such as “She felt secure enough with herself, and her surroundings, that she got her friends Estevan and Esperanza to lie to the people that decided whether or not the adoption papers would be signed.”	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Form and Structure (S) • A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.	The straightforward chronological arrangement of each new challenge that Taylor faces in her quest for independence and security provides direction for the appropriately developed discussion of how <i>The Bean Trees</i> “explores the life of a teenager setting out on a journey with no destination.” The controlling idea—that “Throughout the story, it was always a need for Taylor to be independent and secure with herself in order to get where she got”—is presented and maintained generally.	S

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Choice (S) • Diction is adequate. • Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. • Stylistic choices contribute to a clear composition with an appropriate voice.	Choices of diction in phrases such as “take matters into her own hands,” “dealt with her problems,” “she didn’t give up,” and “handle the situations” are adequate. Syntactic structures (“She realized the problems that she was facing, and she dealt with them”) are straightforward. Attempts at complex structures, however, are awkward, as in “She knew in her heart that she had done this all on her own, the choices she made to try and better herself along with Turtle, as well as just doing what her heart desired.” Stylistic choices, as in the statement “In the beginning of the novel, Barbara Kingsolver explains how Taylor does not want to end up like the other girls in her rural community in Kentucky,” contribute to a clear composition with an appropriate voice.	S

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Correctness (S) • This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors. • However, the communication remains clear.	In this response, statements such as “She lived with Lou Ann, had a job, and was able to take care of Turtle” demonstrate control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Occasional lapses in control and minor errors are demonstrated in “When Taylor was faced with the reality that she had no legal attachment to Turtle, and that she would have to give her up unless she could come up with a legal statement from Turtles legal guardians saying that she was now the legal guardian of Turtle.” Communication remains clear, as is evident in “She acted independently with the need for security. Turtle was Taylor’s security in the end.”	S

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text(s) you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text(s) you have chosen.

Literary Text(s) and Text Creator(s) A Streetcar Named Desire by Tennessee Williams.

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)

Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text(s) you have identified above as support for your response. You may respond in point form, using a diagram such as a mind map, or in another format of your choice. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

- nobody believes in her
 - insecurity hinders independence
 - she falls apart
- Stanley jumps on the bandwagon with Sten
- "cemetery"
- hopelessness (doctor and orderly)
- kindness of strangers

(Page 1 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Dependence on Security

Desire for independence is a characteristic that everyone possesses, but without the availability of security, the quest for independence is near impossible. Individuals always have a sense of exploring uncharted territory, and they often seek to conquer this newfound reality by their own methods, without the influence of others. However, if these individuals have nothing to fall back on, no sense of security when the road doesn't head in the favorable direction, their chances of success are hindered to a point of near impossibility. In the play A Streetcar Named Desire, by *Tennessee Williams*, Blanche seeks independence, but lacks an important detail in achieving this goal; a sense of security from those who she can trust. Those who surround Blanche don't believe in her, and don't trust her. As well, they don't respect her quest for independence, they believe it is fanciful and not proper for an adult.

When Blanche arrives at her sister's house, she is happily greeted by her sister Stella, but Stella's husband Stanley doesn't share the same enthusiasm. Right from the beginning, Stanley is skeptical and never offers trust or even respect for Blanche. Blanche seeks a new lifestyle, trying to leave behind her life in Laurel. This is very apparent by the symbolic streetcar named "Desire" that she rides when she arrives in New Orleans. Blanche is labeled as already being quite independent, living alone without a husband, trying to defend Belle Reve on her own, and traveling to a different

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

environment for a new life, without the support of others. But as *Tennessee Williams* expresses through small details and comments made by Blanche, changing her life and finding love isn't the only thing she is concerned with.

Blanche's absence of love in her life seems, on the surface, one of the main reasons why she has moved on from Laurel. Her quick affection towards Mitch gives the impression that Blanche is lacking the presence of an intimate mate, but this is proved inaccurate by the comment "I've always depended on the kindness of strangers," which is stated by Blanche during the play. This hints to the reader that Blanche seeks something else in life besides intimacy; the possible security and dependability offered by individuals she meets on her way towards achieving independence. This statement proves that she is in search of something more, most likely the underlying reason why she has come to New Orleans.

As the play progresses, Blanche is faced with the harsh reality of conformity. Stanley had never believed in Blanche, and to Blanche's disadvantage, Stella and Mitch begin to jump on the bandwagon and adopt this idea. When Blanche realizes that her sense of security is diminishing, her goals and dreams begin to fade. Because of this realization, Blanche can no longer deal with the harsh realities. Without anyone trustworthy to lean on, coupled with the overwhelming sense of insecurity, she begins to enter a fairytale world, making up superficial stories such as the telegram from Shep Huntleigh. It is clear that Blanche cannot achieve her goals because of her surrounding

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

company's inability to believe in her, and this plays a major role in the hindering of Blanche's goal of independence.

When Blanche realizes that she cannot find security in New Orleans, not from a kind loving man like Mitch, or even her own sister Stella, Blanche is overwhelmed with hopelessness. This failure of her last resort is foreshadowed by the streetcar she must transfer to called "cemeteries." It symbolizes the end of the road, the place where you end up when you are done living. When all respect is lost for Blanche, they call a doctor and order her from a mental institution to take Blanche away. Again, Blanche identifies that she needs security when she tells the doctor "I've always depended on the kindness of strangers." Unfortunately, this need had never been fulfilled, and this led to her demise. Without that important factor, her quest for independence had been completely diminished.

Without security, an individual is unable to function independently from their peers. Confidence is needed when one desires independence, but if they have nothing that they know they can fall back on, they lose confidence in themselves. The amount of security one has available will ultimately shape their identity, and will lead them to success, or drag them to their failure.

(Page 4 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Thought and Understanding (Pf) • Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. • Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.	The student’s thoughtful and considered idea that “Blanche seeks independence, but lacks an important detail in achieving this goal; a sense of security from those who she can trust” develops into the competent literary interpretation that Blanche’s quest for independence involves “trying to leave behind her life in Laurel” and seeking “something else in life besides intimacy; the possible security and dependability offered by individuals she meets on her way towards achieving independence.” As evidenced in “When Blanche realizes that she cannot find security in New Orleans, not from a kind loving man like Mitch, or even her own sister Stella, Blanche is overwhelmed with hopelessness. This failure of her last resort is foreshadowed by the streetcar she must transfer to called ‘cemeteries,’ ” literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Supporting Evidence (Pf) • Support is relevant, accurate, and occasionally deliberately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a logical and clear way. • A clear connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.	Support is relevant—“Blanche’s absence of love in her life seems, on the surface, one of the main reasons why she has moved on from Laurel,” accurate—“Without anyone trustworthy to lean on, coupled with the overwhelming sense of insecurity, she begins to enter a fairytale world, making up superficial stories such as the telegram from Shep Huntleigh,” and occasionally deliberately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a logical and clear way—“Her quick affection towards Mitch gives the impression that Blanche is lacking the presence of an intimate mate.” A clear connection to the student’s ideas is maintained throughout the discussion of “When Blanche arrives at her sister’s house, she is happily greeted by her sister Stella, but Stella’s husband Stanley doesn’t share the same enthusiasm. Right from the beginning, Stanley is skeptical and never offers trust or even respect for Blanche” and “When all respect is lost for Blanche, they call a doctor and orderly from a mental institution to take Blanche away. Again, Blanche identifies that she needs security when she tells the doctor ‘I’ve always depended on the kindness of strangers.’”	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Form and Structure (Pf) • A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a competent and controlled discussion that is developed capably. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.	A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details such as “Those who surround Blanche don’t believe in her, and don’t trust her. As well, they don’t respect her quest for independence” contributes to a competent and controlled discussion of how “Blanche realizes that her sense of security is diminishing, her goals and dreams begin to fade. Because of this realization, Blanche can no longer deal with the harsh realities” that is capably developed. The controlling idea (“Desire for independence is a characteristic that everyone possesses, but without the availability of security, the quest for independence is near impossible”) is coherently sustained and presented with the discussion of Blanche’s arrival in New Orleans, her search for intimacy and security with Mitch, the lack of support from Stella and Stanley, and her realization that “she cannot find security in New Orleans.”	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Choice (Pf) • Diction is specific. • Syntactic structures are generally effective. • Stylistic choices contribute to a competent composition with a capable voice.	Specific diction choices are evident in “exploring uncharted territory” and “quick affection.” Syntactic structures in statements such as “However, if these individuals have nothing to fall back on, no sense of security when the road doesn’t head in the favorable direction, their chances of success are hindered to a point of near impossibility” are generally effective. Stylistic choices (“The amount of security one has available will ultimately shape their identity, and will lead them to success, or drag them too their failure”) contribute to the creation of a competent composition with a capable voice.	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Correctness (Pf) • This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.	Competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics is demonstrated in “However, if these individuals have nothing to fall back on, no sense of security when the road doesn’t head in the favorable direction, their chances of success are hindered to a point of near impossibility.” Minor errors in complex structures such as “Without security, and individual is unable to function independently from their peers” are understandable, considering the complexity and length of the student’s response.	Pf

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Initial Planning

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text(s) you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text(s) you have chosen.

Literary Text(s) and
Text Creator(s)

Wars, Timothy Findley

A Doll's House, Henrik Ibsen

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)

Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text(s) you have identified above as support for your response. You may respond in point form, using a diagram such as a mind map, or in another format of your choice. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

war — Levitt, freaks out when the mines
go off. No security = fear

— Purchas wants to go off to war
"heaven sent chance of being a man"
gets shot in the back running away

— Robert runs away because of

(Page 1 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Independence and Security

Every individual searches for the delicate balance between independence and security. It is difficult to have one without imposing the freedoms of the other. While many people know that they desire independence, they fail to realize that somewhere deeper inside themselves they need security. In the play, “A Doll’s House”, by Henrik Ibsen, the use of character development and to some extent the use of symbolism is used to display the central theme. The symbol and title of a child’s toy, “A Doll’s House”, demonstrates how individuals become stifled by their situation, trapped by limitations which lead them to yearn for independence. Individuals often crave independence because of restricting circumstances that cause them to dislike their secure position. Likewise too much independence can cause an individual to search for the assurance that security brings. The character development of Nora and Christine Linde demonstrates how individuals work to gain either independence or security for different reasons and motives brought about by their situations and experiences in life. As both of these characters are in different seasons in their lives they come to different and very opposite conclusions about what they truly desire.

The central symbolic element of “A Doll’s House” is simply a doll’s house. The author of the play uses this reference to a child’s toy to demonstrate the mentality of the social conditions of the 1800’s. In many homes during this time period the woman was considered to be the “doll” which the husband could dress up nicely and have to serve his whims in the home. The woman of the house was to be completely subservient and take on the opinions and mannerisms which the husband wished her to have. In Ibsen’s play

(Page 2 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

he capitalizes on this social condition by creating characters that play the “roles” of this mentality. Nora makes reference to this idea when she speaks to Torvald about being his and her father’s doll. The doll symbolizes a woman whom has no independence but rather acts within her role to play an ideal wife or daughter. The central thought behind this idea is that the security of being cared for and serving as a role model wife should be more than enough for any woman to feel satisfied with. However as modern day social conditions demonstrate, this concept does not sit well with Nora. The play expresses how some women are not satisfied with merely living their lives through someone else’s position. It pursues the idea that women should be given the opportunity to express themselves without the restrictions of a husband’s opinion because there is so much more to life than always being, thinking, talking and breathing what someone else believes. While the “puppeteer” may find the doll’s house situation agreeable, as he has the control to manipulate the dolls the way that he wishes, the “doll” finds the situation intolerable. This symbol serves to show how being forced to play a role in life often stifles an individual and causes one to search and want for more. In doing so, the individual cultivates a desire for independence as an escape from the conditions that control them. Individuals mistake the control imposed on them (which they resent) for security rather than the social manipulation that it is. Every individual needs security of some kind whether it comes from a strong sense of self or whether it is developed and nurtured by the people in one’s life. The characters in “A Doll’s House” play the part of a game that essentially stifles Nora’s sense of independence and causes her to search for greater independence to the point that she believes she no longer requires the security of a husband. However Christine longs for the sense of assurance that a doll’s house brings.

(Page 3 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

The character of Christine in the play serves as an example of a woman torn by her desire for independence as well as her need for economic security. In contrast to Nora, Mrs. Linde has a past of hardship and suffering in which she is forced to make sacrifices that she now regrets. Due to her mother's illness, Christine abandons the love of her life, Krogstad, and marries a man of wealth to support her younger brothers. Although she may have wished to continue her relationship with Krogstad, her independence is cut short by the needs imposed on her by her family. At that time in her life the need for sound, economic security takes priority above her own will to have a relationship with Krogstad. Christine comes to regret this decision when her wealthy husband dies leaving her alone and bankrupt. As we see her reflect upon her life, Christine comes to the realization that the independence which she longed for is not enough to satisfy all the facets of her character. Independence can lead to loneliness when it is not properly coupled with companionship and the security that it provides. It is not the financial burden of independence but rather the lack of intimacy and relationships that a loving relationship provides. In this case, Christine realizes that she dislikes her independence and wants to have more of a secure tone to her life. She is willing to continue to provide the financial resources for her and Krogstad so that she maintains some independence and power while experiencing the benefits of companionship. The various phases of Christine's life seem to either be of complete security and little independence or of full independence with little security. It is only through experiencing both sides of the spectrum that Christine realizes what she truly desires and comes to appreciate. This is a realization that can only be determined by experience, of which Nora has none.

(Page 4 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Nora is a young character that acts in direct contrast to Christine. She is young, silly and gripped by her own desire for power and self fulfillment. Nora views independence as power, strength and authority. Near the beginning of the play Nora is proud to tell Christine of how she was able to get a loan all by herself to pay for her family's trip to Italy. During the time period of the play it is difficult if not impossible for a woman to do something so authoritative as requesting a loan without her husband's consent, and the fact that she is able to do so brings Nora pride. Nora loves the power that "acting like a man" brings to her as she cleverly finds ways to pay back her loan bit by bit. Nora's desire to gain independence stems from her belief that she is treated as a doll and held down by her role as a compliant wife and mother. Above all things she is stifled by her husband's wish to have her act and believe as he does. Nora hates how she is not allowed to go and buy macaroons to eat without asking her husband. She hates that she needs to ask to do things, just like a child would ask her father. Nora is very different from Christine in that she has not experienced as many hardships in life that would cause her to appreciate the security and affection she has in her marriage. The power she experiences from paying off her loan feeds her desire for independence and increases her confidence that she is able to provide for herself. Nora's symbolic change of dress in the final stages of the play represents Nora's dismissal and refusal of the artificial relational security her husband offers her and her assertion to leave and gain knowledge of her own. Nora's limited experiences only allow her to see life as a doll and nothing else. It is because of her limited perspective that she chooses the opposite path of Christine and walks towards self-sufficiency and away from the safety of her life.

(Page 5 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Independence is a quality often associated with power, self-reliance and control. It is a sought after commodity in today's day and age by women and men alike because it demonstrates one's success at making it on their own. However, independence can also mean loneliness, isolation and lack of certainty in the future. It is the delicate mix of both of these ideals that every individual strives for, whether they realize it or not. However the focus of an individual's search develops from the situations that one has experienced in life.

(Page 6 of 6)

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Thought and Understanding (E) - Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. - Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.	The student introduces the insightful and carefully considered idea that “Individuals often crave independence because of restricting circumstances that cause them to dislike their secure position. Likewise too much independence can cause an individual to search for the assurance that security brings.” This idea demonstrates the student’s comprehension of subtle literary distinctions between Christine and Nora in relation to the topic. The literary interpretation that “In Ibsen’s play he capitalizes on this social condition by creating characters that play the ‘roles’ of this mentality” is perceptive. The student’s idea that “In doing so, the individual cultivates a desire for independence as an escape from the conditions that control them. Individuals mistake the control imposed on them (which they resent) for security rather than the social manipulation that it is” is illuminating.	E

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Supporting Evidence (E) • Support is explicit, precise, and deliberately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an effective and judicious way. • A strong connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.	Support such as “Due to her mother’s illness, Christine abandons the love of her life, Krogstad, and marries a man of wealth to support her younger brothers. Although she may have wished to continue her relationship with Krogstad, her independence is cut short by the needs imposed on her by her family” is explicit and precise. Details regarding both Christine’s and Nora’s struggles within the social context of Ibsen’s play—as in “While the ‘puppeteer’ may find the doll’s house situation agreeable, as he has the control to manipulate the dolls the way that he wishes, the ‘doll’ finds the situation intolerable”—are deliberately chosen to reinforce the ideas presented in an effective and judicious way. Throughout the comparison of Christine and Nora (as demonstrated in “It is because of her limited perspective that she chooses the opposite path of Christine and walks towards self-sufficiency and away from the safety of her life”) a strong connection to the student’s ideas is maintained.	E

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Form and Structure (E) • An effective arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent and shaped discussion that is developed skillfully. • The unifying effect or controlling idea is consistently sustained and integrated.	An effective arrangement of ideas in details is evident in the student’s initial examination of the symbolic significance of the doll’s house in the play—“The symbol and title of a child’s toy, ‘A Doll’s House’, demonstrates how individuals become stifled by their situation, trapped by limitations which lead them to yearn for independence”—which provides a context for the fluent and shaped comparison and contrast of the characters of Nora and Christine that is developed skillfully. The controlling idea that the “character development of Nora and Christine Linde demonstrates how individuals work to gain either independence or security for different reasons and motives brought about by their situations and experiences in life” is consistently sustained and integrated throughout the response.	E

English Language Arts 30–1

Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Choice (E) • Diction is precise. • Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. • Stylistic choices contribute to a confident composition with a convincing voice.	Diction choices such as “completely subservient,” “cultivates a desire for independence,” “both sides of the spectrum,” and “compliant wife and mother” are precise. As demonstrated in “While many people know that they desire independence, they fail to realize that somewhere deeper inside themselves they need security” and “Above all things she is stifled by her husband’s wish to have her act and believe as he does,” syntactic structures are effective and polished. Stylistic choices (as in “It is the delicate mix of both of these ideals that every individual strives for, whether they realize it or not”) contribute to the creation of a confident composition with a convincing voice.	E

English Language Arts 30–1
Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment, June 2005

Commentary for Example Scored Excellent (E)

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE	SCORE
Matters of Correctness (E) • This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. • The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.	This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics: “It pursues the idea that women should be given the opportunity to express themselves without the restrictions of a husband’s opinion because there is so much more to life than always being, thinking, talking and breathing what someone else believes.” The relative absence of error is impressive, considering the length and complexity of the response.	E

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005**

**Personal Response to
Texts Assignment**

Because students' responses to the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Ideas and Impressions (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1

When marking **Ideas and Impressions**, the marker should consider the quality of

- the student's **exploration** of the topic
- the student's **ideas** and **reflection**
- **support** in relation to the student's ideas and impressions

Excellent

E

The student's exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student's ideas and impressions.

Proficient

Pf

The student's exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student's ideas and impressions.

Satisfactory

S

The student's exploration of the topic is generalized. Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. Support is adequate and clarifies the student's ideas and impressions.

Limited

L

The student's exploration of the topic is vague. Perceptions and/or ideas are superficial and/or ambiguous. Support is imprecise and/or ineffectively related to the student's ideas and impressions.

Poor

P

The student's exploration of the topic is minimal. Perceptions and/or ideas are underdeveloped and/or irrelevant. Support is lacking and/or unrelated to the student's ideas and impressions.

Insufficient

INS

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions **OR**
- the marker can discern no evidence of an attempt to address the task presented in the assignment

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Personal Response to
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Presentation (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

Senior High School English Language Arts 3.1 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider the effectiveness of

- **voice** in relation to the context created by the student in the chosen prose form
- **stylistic choices** (including quality of language and expression) and the student's creation of **tone**
- the student's development of a **unifying effect**

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent

E

The voice created by the student is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise and the student's creation of tone is adept. The unifying effect is skillfully developed.

Proficient

Pf

The voice created by the student is distinct. Stylistic choices are specific and the student's creation of tone is competent. The unifying effect is capably developed.

Satisfactory

S

The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student's creation of tone is conventional. The unifying effect is appropriately developed.

Limited

L

The voice created by the student is indistinct. Stylistic choices are imprecise and the student's creation of tone is inconsistent. The unifying effect is inadequately developed.

Poor

P

The voice created by the student is obscure. Stylistic choices impede communication and the student's creation of tone is ineffective. A unifying effect is absent.

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Critical / Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment**

Because students' responses to the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

Thought and Understanding (7.5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Thought and Understanding**, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student's **ideas** relate to the assignment
- the quality of the **literary interpretations** and **understanding**

Excellent

E

Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.

Proficient

Pf

Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.

Satisfactory

S

Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are general but plausible.

Limited

L

Ideas are superficial or oversimplified, demonstrating a weak comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are incomplete and/or literal.

Poor

P

Ideas are largely absent or irrelevant, and/or do not develop the topic. Little comprehension of the literary text(s) is demonstrated.

Insufficient

INS

Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality. Assign insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Thought and Understanding and/or Supporting Evidence **OR**
- no reference has been made to literature studied **OR**
- the only literary reference present is to the text(s) on the examination **OR**
- the marker can discern no evidence of an attempt to address the task presented in the assignment

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Critical / Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Supporting Evidence (7.5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.3 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Supporting Evidence**, the marker should consider

- the **selection** and **quality** of evidence
- how well the supporting evidence is **integrated, synthesized,** and/or **developed** to support the student's ideas

Consider ideas presented in the *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*.

Excellent E	Support is explicit, precise, and deliberately chosen to reinforce the student's ideas in an effective and judicious way. A strong connection to the student's ideas is maintained.
Proficient Pf	Support is relevant, accurate, and occasionally deliberately chosen to reinforce the student's ideas in a logical and clear way. A clear connection to the student's ideas is maintained.
Satisfactory S	Support is appropriate, general, and adequately reinforces the student's ideas but occasionally may lack persuasiveness and/or consistency. A straightforward connection to the student's ideas is maintained.
Limited L	Support is repetitive, contradictory, and/or ambiguous, and may be inappropriate or merely a restatement of what was read. The connection to the student's ideas is vague and/or unclear.
Poor P	Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, and/or lacking. The support, if present, is largely unrelated to any idea(s) that may be present.

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Critical / Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Form and Structure (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.2 3.1 4.1 4.2

When marking **Form and Structure**, the marker should consider how effectively the student's organizational choices result in

- a **coherent, focused, and shaped** discussion in response to the assignment
- a **unifying effect** or a **controlling idea** that is developed and maintained

Excellent
E An effective arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent and shaped discussion that is developed skillfully. The unifying effect or controlling idea is consistently sustained and integrated.

Proficient
Pf A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a competent and controlled discussion that is developed capably. The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.

Satisfactory
S A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.

Limited
L A discernible but ineffectual arrangement of ideas and details provides some direction for the discussion that is not deliberately developed. A unifying effect or controlling idea is inconsistently maintained.

Poor
P A haphazard arrangement of ideas and details provides little or no direction for the discussion, and development is lacking or obscure. A unifying effect or controlling idea is absent.

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Critical / Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Matters of Choice (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student's choices enhance communication. The marker should consider

- **diction**
- choices of **syntactic structures** (such as parallelism, balance, inversion)
- the extent to which **stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of **voice**

Excellent
E Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to a confident composition with a convincing voice.

Proficient
Pf Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to a competent composition with a capable voice.

Satisfactory
S Diction is adequate. Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. Stylistic choices contribute to a clear composition with an appropriate voice.

Limited
L Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Syntactic structures are frequently awkward and/or ambiguous. Inadequate language choices contribute to a vague composition with an undiscerning voice.

Poor
P Diction is overgeneralized and/or inaccurate. Syntactic structures are uncontrolled and/or unintelligible. A lack of language choices contributes to a confused composition with an ineffective voice.

**Scoring Categories and
Scoring Criteria for
2004–2005
Critical / Analytical
Response to Literary
Texts Assignment
(continued)**

Matters of Correctness (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for
Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Correctness**, the marker should consider the correctness of

- **sentence construction** (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
- **usage** (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
- **grammar** (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
- **mechanics** (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent
E This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.

Proficient
Pf This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.

Satisfactory
S This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors. However, the communication remains clear.

Limited
L This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of errors blurs the clarity of communication.

Poor
P This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Jarring errors impair communication.