

Student Exemplar: 5.2 Initial Planning – Formative Feedback

Critical/Analytical Response to Texts Outline – Transformation Focus

Note: Rose’s plan is focusing on the film *Star Trek (The Prequel)*. Your plan must focus on one of the films on the list and your thesis must be approved by your teacher before you can plan.

Introductory Paragraph: Introduce	
Introduce the topic. Use a quotation from the film or a brief anecdote that is related to the topic, that captures the reader’s attention.	JJ Abrams’ movie <i>Star Trek</i> was exciting to watch. Lots of action and a great story.
Introduce the film and character you will discuss. Include the director, actor/actress, and the character’s name.	JJ Abrams’ movie <i>Star Trek</i>
In a single thesis statement, answer the assigned question so it is clear what you will prove in your essay, and include a “because” or “but” clause. Your thesis must explain the relationship between the key words in the essay topic. Use key words from the essay topic in the phrasing of your thesis statement.	By studying their experiences and the consequences of their actions, we learn that it is important to learn from our experiences if we want to be successful.
Body Paragraph 1: Prior to Transformation	
State the topic sentence. Be sure it relates to the thesis statement and clearly focuses on the character prior to transformation.	Kirk is a hot-headed young man who is fatherless and challenges leadership.
Introduce the character, and explain that character’s role in the film.	To provide conflict among the characters and commanding officers.
Describe the character at the beginning of the story, before he or she transforms.	Challenging, angry, a hot-head, loyal
Develop specific, supporting evidence from the film (effects of cinematic techniques and quotations), always showing how the evidence contributes to your topic and proves your thesis.	Spock: Get him off this ship. James T. Kirk: Stardate: 2258.42... or, uh, 4... Whatever. Acting Captain Spock has marooned me on Delta Vega, in what I believe to be a violation of Security Protocol 49.09 governing the treatment of prisoners aboard a star... [Kirk breaks off abruptly before completing the word starship as the howl of a predatory animal is heard, possibly heading his way]
Conclude, connecting your topic to the thesis, and transition to the next body paragraph.	His experiences in the film lead Kirk to change and become the strong leader we know and love.

Comment [CK1]: This is a ‘meh’ introduction – choose a quote from the film that will catch the reader’s attention.

Comment [CK2]: Remember, this is a critical essay: Use 3rd person point of view and not 1st person (we, us, our, my, I, etc.)

Comment [CK3]: Consider his entire role, from beginning to end: If his transformation is connected to the idea of success, consider his experiences as a whole and revise your statement.

Comment [CK4]: You will want to provide commentary for each quotation: How do these quotes contribute to the topic/thesis?

Body Paragraph 2: Cause of Transformation	
State the topic sentence. Be sure it relates to the thesis statement and clearly focuses on the cause of the character's transformation.	Kirk's lack of a father-figure causes him to be an over-confident person who seems to enjoy conflict. "I don't believe in no-win situations."
Explain the circumstances that cause the character's transformation to begin. Describe how the character initially reacts.	Kirk disagrees with Spock's decision and refuses to leave. Spock knocks him out and ships him back to the Delta Vega for mutiny.
Develop specific, supporting evidence from the film (effects of cinematic techniques and quotations) that show the cause of transformation, always showing how the evidence proves the thesis.	Mid-angle shots show the emotional battles Kirk undergoes.
	<p>Spock: We must gather with the rest of Starfleet... to balance the terms of the next engagement!</p> <p>James T. Kirk: There won't BE a next engagement! By the time we've "gathered," it'll be too late! But you say he's from the future - knows what's gonna happen? - then the logical thing is to be unpredictable!</p> <p>Spock: You're assuming that Nero knows how events are predicted to unfold. The contrary, Nero's very presence has altered the flow of history, beginning with the attack on the U.S.S. Kelvin, culminating in the events of today, thereby creating an entire new chain of incidents that cannot be anticipated by either party.</p> <p>Lt. Nyota Uhura: An alternate reality.</p> <p>Spock: Precisely. Whatever our lives might have been, if the time continuum was disrupted, our destinies have changed.</p>
	The above scene illustrates that Kirk is beginning to understand that teamwork is needed in order to achieve success against the Romulans.
Conclude, connecting your topic to the thesis, and transition to the next body paragraph.	Learning from our own experiences, as well as those of others, can lead us to change our perceptions and lead us to success.
Body Paragraph 3: During Transformation	
State the topic sentence. Be sure it relates to the thesis statement and clearly focuses on the character during the process of transformation.	Learning about others' experiences can help put a new perspective to our own situation and help us realize that our limited experience may be keeping us from growth.
Describe how the character is changing as seen in key moments in the text. Support your ideas with specific evidence (effects of cinematic techniques and quotations), always showing how the evidence proves the thesis.	James T. Kirk: That same anomaly, a "lightning storm in space" that we saw today, also occurred on the day of my birth, shortly before a Romulan ship attacked the U.S.S. Kelvin. You know that, sir, I read your dissertation. That ship, which had formidable and advanced weaponry, was never seen or heard from again. The Kelvin attack took place at the edge of Klingon space, and at 2300 hours last night, there was an attack: forty-seven Klingon warbirds destroyed by

Comment [CK5]: How does this connect to the thesis and how does it cause his transformation?

Comment [CK6]: There are other instances of 1st person in your plan – be sure you find them from here on out and change them in your rough draft.

	Romulans, sir, and it was reported that the Romulans were in one ship, one massive ship.
	Kirk's experiences in the future with Spock, among others, prove to him that Vulcans do feel. He realizes he is wrong for challenging his captain and he learns that future challenges will be necessary.
Consider the way in which the character has to make a choice between an old and new way of thinking or behaving.	His experiences in the past and the future, as well as learning more about his commanding officers and crew members, help Kirk realize that he has been selfish. He is starting to realize that he has to somehow mesh his old self with his new self that is emerging.
Conclude, connecting your topic to the thesis, and transition to the next body paragraph.	Growing from our experiences and mistakes allow us to be successful in our lives.

Comment [CK7]: Are there other characters' experiences which impacted Kirk's perspective during his transformation?

Comment [CK8]: A strong idea, here.

Body Paragraph 4: After Transformation	
State the topic sentence. Be sure it relates to the thesis statement and clearly focuses on the character after transformation.	Kirk's experiences allow him to change for the better and he achieves success, both personally and professionally.
Describe how the character has changed. Explain the outcome of the transformation—who the character "is" at the end of the text. How does this transformation process affect those around him or her? Why does his or her transformation matter?	Kirk is no longer selfish, or a hot-head. He has learned to consider others' opinions in accordance with the mission and is able to secure a position as Captain with the Enterprise.
Support your ideas with specific evidence from the text (effects of cinematic techniques and quotations) that the character has transformed in an important way.	<p>Spock: [Kirk has been appointed captain, and the Enterprise is preparing to depart. Spock enters the bridge] Permission to come aboard, Captain.</p> <p>James T. Kirk: Permission granted.</p> <p>Spock: As you have yet to select a first officer, respectfully, I would like to submit my candidacy. Should you desire, I can provide character references.</p> <p>James T. Kirk: It would be my honor, Commander.</p>
	<p>Spock: [volunteering for what could be a suicide mission] Romulans and Vulcans share a common ancestor. Our cultural similarities will make it easier for me to access the ship's computer to locate the device. Also, my mother was human, which makes Earth the only home I have left.</p> <p>James T. Kirk: I'm coming with you.</p>

	<p>Spock: I would cite regulation, but I know you will simply ignore it.</p> <p>James T. Kirk: See? We are getting to know each other.</p>
	Both of the scenes above support Kirk's transformation: He is willing to help others and put his own life on the line. He also has respect for Spock's experiences and takes time to listen to his friend.
Conclude, connecting your topic to the thesis, and transition to the concluding paragraph.	Success doesn't happen overnight: It takes learning from one's own past, one's present, and one's friends to promote change in one's self.

Concluding Paragraph: Conclude	
Restate your thesis statement in different words, confirming your thesis has been proven.	Success comes from learning from our experiences and often these experiences will change us for the better.
Reconnect with your introductory paragraph: → How has the character's transformation illuminated the topic? → How does the topic relate to people in society?	Kirk illustrates how changing one's beliefs in one's self and those around us can lead to success. Everyone wants to be the best version of themselves, and being open to experiences, both our own and of those around us, can lead to change and success.
Include final words to leave the reader thinking: a quotation, an anecdote, or a strong statement or question.	Learning from our failures, and the failures of others, can lead us to success.

You present some thoughtful ideas, but don't use the film effectively to demonstrate your ideas. Pull in some film techniques (music, camera angles, and/or lighting) to support your ideas without quoting from the film. You are generalizing the support you have at the end, rather than providing specific commentary for each piece of evidence provided.

The quotations you have provided are from the first half of the film; your textual evidence should demonstrate understanding of the film (and the character's transformation) in its entirety - pull in details from throughout the film not just the beginning half.

When writing your rough draft, be sure to stick to the 3rd person point of view and work towards expanding your ideas through the commentary on your evidence.