



Darcy's 2.9 Comparison Essay PLAN Option #1

Essential Question

Write which of the two essential questions you have chosen in the space below.

What roles do success and failure play in the pursuit of living well?

Thesis Statement

Write a one- to two-sentence thesis statement for your essay. It should be a sentence that answers the essential question and takes a clear position on the question. Include a "because" or "but" statement.

Both success and failure can lead to a well-lived life because what matters most is one's attitude.

Topic Sentence—Body Paragraph #1

Write one sentence that sums up this paragraph about a character who demonstrates the essential question in a **positive** way.

The character of Wes Holman in the short story "Long, Long After School" is an example of how a person who is seen as a failure in society's eyes can still live well with a positive attitude.

Topic Sentence—Body Paragraph #2

Write one sentence that sums up this paragraph about a character who demonstrates the essential question in a **negative** way.

The character of Mrs. Swinton from the short story "Supertoys Last All Summer Long" is an example of how a person who is seen as a success in society's eyes doesn't automatically have a good life if that person has a bad attitude.

Topic Sentence—Body Paragraph #3

Write one sentence that sums up this paragraph about the **outcomes** of each character's life in light of how they demonstrated the essential question. Keep this general. You will go into detail later in the paragraph.

These characters show that what matters is one's own attitude about life not whether other people consider one's life a "success" or "failure."

Introduction	
Hook (Use a creative attention getter—short story, question, strong statement, statistic, quotation from a text, etc.)	<i>"It's not what happens to you. It's what you do about it." Talk about W. Mitchell and the motorcycle crash that changed his life and attitude.</i>
Background Information (introduce the topic and any texts/authors/characters you'll be discussing.)	<i>Introduce the topic of success and failure. Introduce titles and authors of both short stories. Quick summary of each story and introduce both main characters.</i>
Thesis Statement (Copy from previous page.)	<i>Both success and failure can lead to a well-lived life because what matters most is one's attitude.</i>







Body Paragraph #1 – Character who is a positive example of essential question	
Topic Sentence (Copy from previous page.)	<i>The character of Wes Holman in the short story "Long, Long After School" is an example of how a person who is seen as a failure in society's eyes can still live well with a positive attitude.</i>
Supporting Example #1 from Text (One example in each body paragraph needs to be a quotation from the text with the page number.)	<i>Even though the community seemed to think of Wes Holman as a failure, Mrs. Tretheway donated blood when he was injured and visited him every day in the hospital and called him "a fine young specimen" (p. 253).</i>
Supporting Example #2 from Text	<i>He worked hard and was voted "best all-round student" (p. 252).</i>
Supporting Example #3 from Text	<i>"His tiny house . . . is furnished with almost nothing but books, and he can quote anyone from Seneca to Henry James. But that's his job: caretaker-about-town" (p.250).</i>

Body Paragraph #2—Character who is a negative example of essential question	
Topic Sentence (Copy from previous page.)	<i>The character of Mrs. Swinton from the short story "Supertoys Last All Summer Long" is an example of how a person who is seen as a success in society's eyes doesn't automatically have a good life if that person has a bad attitude.</i>
Supporting Example #1 from Text (One example in each body paragraph needs to be a quotation from the text with the page number.)	<i>Mrs. Swinton was a "beautiful woman" (p. 10). She lived in a world where it was "always summer," but "time waited on her shoulder with the manic sloth it reserves for children, the insane, and wives whose husbands are away improving the world" (p. 9). Life was perfect, but she was bored.</i>
Supporting Example #2 from Text	<i>Even though she couldn't have children, she had a robot child who did everything he could to love her, and she "had tried to love him" (p. 9) but clearly didn't. She assumed all his efforts to show his love were because of a malfunctioning "communication centre" (p. 16).</i>
Supporting Example #3 from Text	<i>She was finally allowed by the government to have a child, which made her happy, but that made her consider getting rid of the robot boy. She already had everything she needed to be happy but didn't appreciate it.</i>

Body Paragraph #3—Outcome of each character's life based on his or her response to the essential question	
Topic Sentence (Copy from previous page.)	<i>These characters show that what matters is one's own attitude about life not whether other people consider one's life a "success" or "failure."</i>
Supporting Example #1 from Text (One example in each body paragraph needs to be a quotation from the text with the page number.)	<i>The community where Wes Holman has lived all his life sees him as a failure: the guy they used to tease, the guy who never had a girlfriend. However, he found Miss Tretheway, who believed in him and saw value in him. He found happiness and success in his own way by enjoying his time with her and becoming educated.</i>
Supporting Example #2 from Text	<i>Mrs. Swinton, had every ingredient for a happy life: beauty, wealth, someone to love her, but it wasn't enough. She was "in despair" (p. 15) until she got the news about having a "real" child, but she most likely will go back to being miserable eventually because she's shown that nothing is ever perfect enough for her.</i>
Supporting Example #3 from Text	<i>All his life, Wes Holman tried to get others to love him, and when someone finally did, he really treasured that love for the rest of his life. On the other hand, Mrs. Swinton found actual proof that her robot child, David, loved her dearly, writing letters saying things like "Dear Mummy, I love you and daddy and the sun is shining" (p. 14), yet she was unable to appreciate what she already had. She wanted more.</i>

Conclusion	
Thesis Statement (Restat in different words.)	<i>A person's attitude about life is so much more important than whether others see him or her as a success or failure.</i>
Essay Wrap-Up (Use a so-what statement, summary of key ideas, or call to action.)	<i>We can all learn a lot from these two characters and people like W. Mitchell (mentioned in my intro.). Take a look at your own life and see how much you already have to appreciate.</i>
Clincher (Include a creative ending to keep audience thinking about your argument: quotation, short story, strong statement, question, etc.)	<i>We will all experience success and failure in our lives. No getting around it. If we take W. Mitchell's advice, we can decide to have a good attitude no matter what happens. That's the recipe for living well.</i>

Darcy's 2.9 Comparison Essay PLAN

Value	Thought and Support	Form and Structure
 Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Your support from the texts is <i>precise</i> and <i>effective</i> .	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> You <i>skillfully</i> develop a unifying effect (organizational structure) through your thesis, topic sentences, and plan for introduction and conclusion.
 Proficient	<input type="checkbox"/> Your support from the texts is <i>specific</i> and <i>relevant</i> .	<input type="checkbox"/> You <i>capably</i> develop a unifying effect (organizational structure) through your thesis, topic sentences, and plan for introduction and conclusion.
 Satisfactory	<input type="checkbox"/> Your support from the texts is <i>appropriate</i> but <i>basic</i> .	<input type="checkbox"/> You <i>adequately</i> develop a unifying effect (organizational structure) through your thesis, topic sentences, and plan for introduction and conclusion.
 Limited	<input type="checkbox"/> Your support from the texts is <i>over-generalized</i> , <i>irrelevant</i> , or <i>absent</i> .	<input type="checkbox"/> You <i>inadequately</i> develop a unifying effect (organizational structure) through your thesis, topic sentences, and plan for introduction and conclusion.
 Resubmission Needed	Your attempt to respond is <i>insufficient</i> . Contact your teacher to discuss suggestions for improvement and resubmission of your work.	
TOTAL: 37/40 = 93%	23/25	14/15
 Assessment	<p>Areas of strength: Darcy, you've set yourself up for a very well-organized essay. Your thesis clearly answers the essential question and takes a stance on the topic. Your topic sentences not only follow the requirements for the assignment, but they show that you understand the topic of success and failure is complex. Excellent choice of characters to illustrate both the positive and negative side of the essential question!</p> <p>Many people would use the character from "Long, Long After School" as a negative example of the essential question, but you used him as a positive example, showing that you see success in a very unique and powerful way.</p> <p>Might I suggest: When you write the essay, your challenge will be to make sure your conclusion doesn't just sound like a repeat of the rest of your essay. Keep it fresh and interesting!</p>	